

### Recommendation 2.1 Evidence Profile (Qualitative)

**Recommendation question 2b:** What are the values, preferences, barriers and facilitators associated with mentorship programs developed to address anti-Black racism in nursing?

**Population:** Black nurses, Black nursing students and allies

**Phenomenon:** Values placed on the outcomes of receiving mentorship to address anti-Black racism in nursing, preferences for how the mentorship is delivered, and barriers and facilitators to the uptake and sustainability of mentorship programs

**Context:** When delivering mentorship programs or receiving mentorship to address anti-Black racism in nursing

**Notes:** Due to a paucity of literature available to directly answer this research question, a search for indirect evidence was conducted. The population was broadened to search for the preferences of all Black or racial minority health providers or health profession students regarding mentorship. The relevance of this evidence (when compared to the original PPC question) was taken into consideration when grading the evidence.

Only review findings focused on people's values and preferences for mentorship programs were assessed using GRADE CERQual. Information about barriers and facilitators was narratively summarized and can be found under the 'Implementation strategies' section for this recommendation in the guideline.

**Recommendation 2.1:** The expert panel suggests that health and social service organizations and academic institutions provide formal mentorship programs for Black nurses and Black nursing students and include the following:

- mentor-mentee dyads that emphasize positive, empathetic relationships
- career progression and advancement strategies
- communication of expectations and goals

**Review finding 1:** Mentees appreciated mentors who were positive, supportive and empathetic. Mentors who are flexible, trustworthy and knowledgeable empowered their mentees to succeed in academic environments.

Studies contributing to the Finding	CERQual Assessment				Overall CERQual Assessment of Confidence	Explanation of Judgement
	Assessment of Methodological Limitations	Assessment of Relevance	Assessment of Coherence	Assessment of Adequacy of Data		
(1–7)	Moderate concerns  Of the seven studies, one study had no concerns, five had some concerns primarily due to no mention of reflexivity and one study had	Minor concerns  A significant proportion of participants in each study were Black with other participants being from racialized communities. In three studies, participants	No concerns	No concerns	Moderate confidence  ⊕⊕⊕○	The finding was graded as moderate confidence due to moderate concerns related to methodological limitations and minor concerns related to assessment of

	serious concerns based on the limited information provided related to data collection and recruitment.	were nurses and nurse leaders. The other participants were high school students, medical students, women scientists and doctor of physical therapy students.				relevance. There were no concerns related to coherence and adequacy of data.
--	--	--	--	--	--	--

**Review finding 1: Individual Study Details**

Reference	Study Design	Country	Participant details	Description of Mentorship program	Illustrative quotes
(1)	Case study methodology using both qualitative and quantitative sources; interviews were conducted	USA	A total of six Black high school students were mentored by six nurses (four Black and two white)	This mentoring program paired students with registered nurses whose objective was to contribute to the career, and psychosocial development of the students with the end goal being to gain admission into a baccalaureate degree nursing program.	<p>“She seemed very supportive as far as college essays and what I wanted to do. We talked about the different types of nurses, what the job entails, the long hours that some nurses work.” I would describe it as helpful and informative. The DINA Project workshops with my mentor helped me as well my parents to learn about what we are looking for in schools, and just basic information about being a nurse in general that we were not sure of before.” I would describe our relationship as mutually respectful.”</p> <p>“My mentor seemed fun, she seemed organized and wise. Yeah, friendly, trusting, and caring. She cares about me. Motivated, reassuring and she took initiative and was trusting. Every time I text her, she gave me an honest and truthful answer. I would say motivational. She motivated me when I was trying to give up.”</p>
(2)	Exploratory qualitative study using interviews	USA	Fourth year female medical students applying to surgical residency; 6 (17.1%) identified as Black	This was not a formal mentorship program. Discussed mentorship approaches in general	<p>“A medical student explained that an effective mentor was “Someone who shows interest in helping you out, like even just willingness, like that’s pretty much it.” Medical students felt that mentors who were approachable and had clear investment were best suited to set their mentees’ up for career success.”</p> <p>“I look for mentors who like they’re just nice people that I don’t feel uncomfortable with, if that makes sense. Like, I feel like, I can be myself. I can still be professional, but you can like be yourself and kind of you can ask a stupid question, and they’ll never belittle you.”</p>
(3)	Mixed methods study design	USA	Participants included Black nurse mentors (16	The Moving Forward Together African American student nurse	“Simply put, to me, mentorship means guidance. Not someone who dictates what you need to do in order to be successful, rather someone who will help you

	using surveys with open-ended questions		women and 1 man) and student mentees (1 man and 13 women)	mentorship program was designed to positively influence the lives of African American nursing students by providing support, fostering character development, enhancing leadership skills, and building self-confidence.	make a plan, encourage, and support you in your journey toward personal and academic success.”
(4)	Exploratory qualitative research using interviews	USA	Participants were women scientists in cancer disparities; 6 of the 16 participants mentees identified as African American.	The UHAND program was 1–2-year mentored training program in cancer disparities research that prioritized the recruitment of minority and/or women scholars.	<p>“Mentees often emphasized the personal aspect of relationships, including their mentors being patient, compassionate, and understanding of their personal situation, including conflicting responsibilities mentees had, the learning curve they were going through, and their goals: ‘I felt like she was putting me before herself, which was really amazing to feel that she really valued me and wanted to invest in me as an early researcher and as a mentee, that was really nice and important to me. I really appreciated that because not every mentor does that.”</p> <p>“I think that’s really important just to have somebody to listen to you and not be afraid to tell your ideas [ . . . ]. If there’s a little give and take, obviously, [ . . . ] or it can be made better [your idea] that’s something that a mentor should share, but also just helping to grow, help that person grow as an academic.”</p> <p>“I think flexibility and patience and understanding and then also, know how to help students raise their expectations for themselves. [ . . . ] being patient with them as they do develop those skills and I think just being a good listener [Laughter] throughout the process and giving constructive criticism. I think, obviously, we have to give them feedback throughout the entire process but never making them feel like they’re not smart enough or they can’t do it. That’s been a big one for me.”</p> <p>“[Mentor’s] contributions are huge. Helping me understand, from the basics, how to raise these questions [ . . . ] and how do you go about redeveloping them if they don’t work, or if what you want to know is impossible? So, in particular working on a paper with the [community partner] and having her guide me in understanding the data, understanding what I need to know, and being able to execute it and her supporting me, and feeling like, I’m going to give this my best shot and she’s there to help me.”</p>

(5)	Quasi-experimental mixed methods, qualitative data was collected through open-ended surveys and focus groups	USA	Participants were Doctor of Physical Therapy students. Of 8 mentees (25%) were Black; 4 of 8 peer (50%) mentors were Black.	The networked mentoring program aligned with the racial/cultural identity development model designed to mitigate social isolation and promote a sense of belonging among first-year racial and ethnic minority Doctor of Physical Therapy students. Matched mentoring teams, included a faculty mentor, peer mentor, and first-year mentee.	"It's not just us speaking to students. It's acknowledging their different learning behaviors and learning about what else they have to go through to be able to sit in that chair and receive the education. I think this program really opened my eyes to - he doesn't just get on the bus and get himself into the chair . . . and he's ready to listen. He went through specific events that happened to him on his way here and just throughout daily life that were really eye-opening. So, maybe I had some assumptions before this program that every student gets there, and they're sitting, and they're ready to learn."
(6)	Mixed methods, qualitative data was collected using focus groups	USA	Participants were physical therapy and nursing students. 2/7 peer mentors were Black.	Mentoring program exploring the effect of virtual mentoring on (1) the development of cross-cultural psychological capital among a group of mostly White health sciences faculty mentors and (2) the effect of perceived competence in mentoring for second-year peer mentors from minoritized backgrounds enrolled in health sciences programs.	<p>"I acted as emotional support to my mentee at times. She dealt with something that was pretty hard on her this past semester in terms of her clinical instructor, who just wasn't showing her the level of respect that she deserved.... I feel like we [the mentoring team] provided a lot of emotional support to the mentee and I think that was helpful for her."</p> <p>"Peer mentors valued the importance of in-person connection, especially when talking about sensitive issues such as race, "If someone is going through something and being able to put my hand on her shoulder and be like "Hey, its ok" That kind of thing was missing"</p> <p>"A mentor is so much more than an advisor. A mentor deals with all of the doubts and anxieties that students have and there's a bigger emotional investment on behalf of the mentor and mentee... I don't feel like that is present in academic advising. And academic advising is more focused on career goals or academic goals or just getting through a program sometimes. But I feel being a mentor really is an investment in trying help this person succeed. It's not something that you can assign"</p>

(7)	Qualitative narrative inquiry design using interviews	USA	Black academic female nurse leaders	This was not a formal mentorship program. Discussed perceptions of mentorship in general	“They are your biggest champions, and you don’t want to disappoint them. You work hard because someone has faith in you,” added Lori. Many of these participants, their mentors, and faculty from the same racial background often expected more from them. They believed in their abilities more than they sometimes believed in themselves
-----	---	-----	-------------------------------------	--	--

<b>Review finding 2:</b> Mentees and mentors valued a relationship guided by strategic decision-making about academic and career pathways that mentees were not previously aware were available to them.						
Studies contributing to the Finding	CERQual Assessment				Overall CERQual Assessment of Confidence	Explanation of Judgement
	Assessment of Methodological Limitations	Assessment of Relevance	Assessment of Coherence	Assessment of Adequacy of Data		
(2,4–9)	Moderate concerns  Of the seven studies, four had some concerns mostly related to minimal information on reflexivity. One study had no concerns, and one study had serious concerns due to limited reporting on data collection and recruitment.	Minor concerns  A significant proportion of participants in each study were Black with other participants being from other racialized communities. Of the seven studies, two studies included participants that were nurses. Other participants include medical students, women scientists and	No Concerns	No concerns	Moderate  ⊕⊕⊕○	The finding was graded as moderate confidence due to moderate concerns related to methodological limitations and minor concerns related to assessment of relevance. There were no concerns related to coherence and adequacy of data.

		doctor of physical therapy students and academic leaders				
--	--	--	--	--	--	--

**Review finding 2: Individual Study Details**

Reference	Study Design	Country	Participant details	Description of mentorship program	Illustrative quotes
(7)	Qualitative narrative inquiry design using interviews	USA	Black academic female nurse leaders	This program examined how Black women academic nurse leaders perceive mentoring in academic nursing using critical race theory as the guiding framework. The program also explored the critical role of mentorship in promoting and advancing Black women academic nurse leaders.	<p>Ally recalled, “The mentor I had in graduate school exposed me to nursing research and mentored me through a Ph.D. program. That exposure set the career path for me. Without her, I had no intention of doing the Ph.D. program.”</p> <p>“Some of the participants at higher leadership levels talked extensively about the positive effects early mentoring had on their careers. Lou remarked, “My early career mentor was happier than me when I got accepted into a Ph.D. program. She was like a proud mama. She refused to give up on me. She gave me my first job opportunity in academia.” -</p> <p>“I understand the experiences of my minority students and faculty. . . .to make a difference, I leverage my position to create equity. I sponsor programs and professional development opportunities to support and guide their development.”</p>
(2)	Qualitative thematic analysis using interviews	USA	Fourth year female medical students applying to surgical residency; 6 (17.1%) identified as Black	This was not a formal mentorship program. Discussed mentorship approaches in general	<p>“For example, my research mentor was like, I think this would be a really great case write-up. This will look great on your application.”</p> <p>“My mentors provide me with research opportunities and direct me to other organizations that will help with like networking and evaluating my future.”</p> <p>“My mentor has also been helpful in navigating some kind of frustrations that I have at work... when to say something and when not to say something, what to say and how to say it.”</p>
(4)	Exploratory qualitative research using interviews	USA	Participants were women scientists in cancer disparities; 6 of	The UHAND program was 1–2-year mentored training program in cancer disparities research that prioritized the recruitment	“Some scholars shared that the participation in the program allowed them to feel support that increased their motivation to build their careers in the sciences: Just the ability for, again, Dr. [name] to really just invest in me and put me in front of her sometimes was really helpful, but it also made me see how I want to continue to do that for future generations of researchers. [ . . .

			the 16 mentees identified as African American.	of minority and/or women scholars.	<p>] now I can also see myself more in academia, to be a mentor and also teach others, but it's also impacted my career path in the sense that now as I'm progressing through my master's degree, and hopefully, future MD. (Mentee, female, undergraduate.)”</p> <p>“Mentees shared that their mentors played a particularly important role in navigating them through different career opportunities both within and outside of academia:</p> <p>‘I’m definitely well prepared in the sense that I have a better idea of what I want to continue to do and work towards in terms of career goals, but I’m also well prepared in terms of the research skills, experiences, and the career development that I gained from the UHAND program.”</p> <p>“Some scholars shared that the participation in the program allowed them to gain confidence in applying for certain jobs and graduate programs: She was like motivating me and encouraging me to do it [applying to high-ranking graduate schools]. I think without that motivation and encouragement, I would have kind of been more intimidated by the process, but I was able to get in those schools, I was very happy. “</p> <p>“Mentors had overall positive feedback on their mentees’ professional development and preparedness for the next step in their education and professional careers:</p> <p>‘Absolutely successful because I feel like she [ . . . ] learned what she expected to learn and what I think UHAND expects us to learn out of their research projects, the research part that they engaged in. Also, for me, the biggest part aside from that is that she’s in graduate school now. She’s doing great. She’s successful and she has taken those skills she learned when she was a UHAND scholar working with me and she’s applying them in graduate school. I feel like it was an absolute success.”</p>
(5)	Quasi-experimental mixed methods: qualitative data was collected through open-	USA	Participants were Doctor of Physical Therapy students. Of 8 mentees (25%) were Black; 4 of	The networked mentoring program aligned with the racial/cultural identity development model designed to mitigate social isolation and promote a sense of	<p>“The networked mentoring model offered mentees differing perspectives. Peer mentors helped mitigate current stressors, while faculty were more future-focused. The differing foci of mentoring sessions is captured here:</p> <p>[My peer mentor] was really good about giving me advice on things like clinical placements that are more relevant to me now as a student, and then for my professor mentor . . . she was helpful having that, not just focus on</p>

	ended surveys and focus groups		8 peer (50%) mentors were Black.	belonging among first-year racial and ethnic minority Doctor of Physical Therapy students. Matched mentoring teams, included a faculty mentor, peer mentor, and first-year mentee.	the material we're thinking about now but thinking about the career projection."  "He put me in touch with [the person] who runs leadership training, for Black and Asian managers ... I didn't fit the criteria, because I was not a team manager so he [influenced my entrance onto the course] by explaining I could be a team manager; I just had lacked opportunity."
(8)	Mixed methods explanatory sequential design; qualitative data was collected from open-ended surveys and focus groups	USA	Participants were minoritized first-year physical therapy and nursing students; 4/8 (50%) of mentees were Black	A virtual mentoring program that engaged minoritized first-year physical therapy, nursing students, faculty and peers. The goal of the program was to decrease social isolation and promote social belonging.	"Mentors were able to provide valuable insight into school and the profession and guide mentees towards navigating challenges: "Both [faculty and peer] mentors helped me because I was getting stressed out about possibly wanting to switch my specialty, and it was something that had been on my mind for a long time . . . I did end up changing my specialty, because of their advice, so I think both of them helped me in terms of my future and just in general."
(6)	Mixed methods	USA	Participants were physical therapy and nursing students. 2/7 peer mentors were Black.	Mentoring program exploring the effect of virtual mentoring on (1) the development of cross-cultural psychological capital among a group of mostly White health sciences faculty mentors and (2) the effect of perceived competence in mentoring for second-year peer mentors from minoritized backgrounds enrolled in health sciences programs.	"While for some, the faculty role still felt out of reach, for others, faculty interactions and the topics of the networking events fueled their motivation to pursue a career in academia:  It also solidified my desire to be a part of academia in the future. Teaching and mentoring - I love it. I don't know if I do it well, but it really makes me feel fulfilled and really happy ... Having the ability to be in a position of being a minority professor, I think is just so important."

(9)	Mixed methods study; surveys were administered and asked open-ended questions	USA	Medical students who identified as underrepresented in urology; 42.3% (n=88) identified as Black	An online mentorship program for underrepresented medicine students interested in urology. The sessions reviewed the “hidden curriculum” of the urology match, application logistics, and handling micro- and macro-aggressions.	“The opportunity to learn and hear about everyone’s different journey into the field of urology. It was a chance to reflect on my own journey into this path and absorb important advice from those who have successfully overcome similar challenges”
-----	---	-----	--	--	--

<b>Review finding 3:</b> Participants preferred mentor-mentee approaches that started with setting explicit, clear goals, expectations and priorities for the relationship. Mentor-mentees desired relationships that remain authentic, flexible with continual open communication dialogue.						
Studies contributing to the Finding	CERQual Assessment				Overall CERQual Assessment of Confidence	Explanation of Judgement
	Assessment of Methodological Limitations	Assessment of Relevance	Assessment of Coherence	Assessment of Adequacy of Data		
(1,4,9,10)	<p>Moderate concerns</p> <p>Of the four studies, one study had no concerns and three had some concerns due to no mention of reflexivity. In one study, the statement of findings could have been clearer.</p>	<p>Minor concerns</p> <p>A significant proportion of participants in each study were Black with other participants being from other racialized communities. In one study, participants were nurses. The other participants were high school students, medical students, women</p>	<p>No concerns</p>	<p>Minor concerns</p> <p>Four studies with fairly adequate data</p>	<p>Moderate</p> <p>⊕⊕⊕○</p>	<p>The finding was graded as moderate confidence due to moderate concerns related to methodological limitations and minor concerns related to assessment of relevance. There were minor concerns related to adequacy of data and no concerns related to coherence</p>

		scientists and occupational therapists.				
--	--	---	--	--	--	--

## Review finding 3: Individual Study Details

Reference	Study Design	Country	Participant details	Description of Mentorship program	Illustrative quotes
(1)	Case study methodology using both qualitative and quantitative source; interviews were conducted	USA	A total of six Black high school students were mentored by six nurses (four Black and two White)	This mentoring program paired students with registered nurses (RNs) whose objective was to contribute to the career, and psychosocial development of the students with the end goal being to gain admission into a baccalaureate degree nursing program.	"We set a goal of narrowing down the list of colleges and submit applications to those schools. Working on college essays, time management, saving, and working on studying were some of our goals. Yes, we met all of them. I have a savings account. I manage my time better. I wrote a schedule out for the days of the week. As far as studying, it's included in my schedule."
(10)	Qualitative research using focus groups	USA	Participants were OTs, Black or from other minority groups	This was not a formal mentorship program. Discussed mentorship approaches in general.	"It's not so much about liking my mentor ... You know being clear about what is it that we are, why are we in this relationship, what is the commitment I'm making and what are you expecting from me as a mentor"
(4)	Exploratory qualitative research using interviews	USA	Participants were women scientists in cancer disparities; six of the 16 mentees identified as African American.	The UHAND program was 1–2-year mentored training program in cancer disparities research that prioritized the recruitment of minority and/or women scholars.	"Having a regular meeting with a mentor was described as helping mentees to keep track of the tasks they were assigned to complete, but also to ensure mentors' accountability and engagement with their mentees' work: I think it was really successful because she took the time to understand how I worked, what I needed, and what I was looking for and what I wanted, and at the same time, I did the same. So, we both went in, knowing each other's expectations and how we worked and how we could work together."
(9)	Mixed methods study; surveys were administered and asked open-ended questions	USA	Medical students who identified as underrepresented in urology; 42.3% (n=88)	An online mentorship program for underrepresented medicine students interested in urology. The sessions reviewed the "hidden curriculum" of the urology match, application logistics, and handling micro- and macro-aggressions.	"I also enjoyed the authenticity and the vulnerability of many of the doctors. It's difficult to find a space in medicine where you can be yourself and I felt like I could be my authentic self during MUA."

			identified as Black	<p>“I especially enjoyed the unwritten rules aspect of the program since it helped to lay out and clarify much of what often feels like an ambiguous and restrictive process.”</p> <p>“Loved the discussions from the top people in the department. the interviews and application review are somewhat hazy from a student standpoint so it is nice to hear directly what is going on.”</p>
--	--	--	---------------------	---

**References**

1. Bundy J. Effective strategies to improve the college-going process of Black students considering nursing education: A Case Study Approach. *Nurse Educ Today*. 2022 Nov;118:105522. doi:10.1016/j.nedt.2022.105522 PubMed PMID: 36081268.
2. Mahendran GN, Walker ER, Bennett M, Chen AY. Qualitative study of mentorship for women and minorities in surgery. *J Am Coll Surg*. 2022 Mar 1;234(3):253–61. doi:10.1097/XCS.000000000000059 PubMed PMID: 35213486.
3. Nelson Y, Mohan A, Chahir Y. The mentoring experience: perceptions of african american nurse leaders and student mentees. *J Nurs Educ*. 2021 Jan 1;60(1):25–8. doi:10.3928/01484834-20201217-06 PubMed PMID: 33400804.
4. Rogova A, Martinez Leal I, Britton M, Chang S, Escoto KH, Solari Williams KD, et al. Promoting cancer health equity: a qualitative study of mentee and mentor perspectives of a training program for underrepresented scholars in cancer health disparities. *Int J Environ Res Public Health*. 2022 Jun 19;19(12):7512. doi:10.3390/ijerph19127512 PubMed PMID: 35742763; PubMed Central PMCID: PMC9223599.
5. Naidoo K, Yuhaniak ,Heather, Borkoski ,Carey, Levangie ,Pamela, and Abel Y. Networked mentoring to promote social belonging among minority physical therapist students and develop faculty cross-cultural psychological capital. *Mentoring & Tutoring: Partnership in Learning*. 2021 Oct 20;29(5):586–606. doi:10.1080/13611267.2021.1986794
6. Naidoo K, Gore S, McKean M, Mullins M, Bowdle G, Mack A, et al. Shared learning spaces: peer and faculty mentors develop skills while supporting minoritized health sciences students. *Health Professions Education*. 2023 Jan 17;9(1). doi:10.55890/2452-3011.1030
7. Iheduru-Anderson KC, Shingles RR. Mentoring experience for career advancement: the perspectives of black women academic nurse leaders. *Glob Qual Nurs Res*. 2023 Feb 20;10. doi:10.1177/23333936231155051 PubMed PMID: 36824223; PubMed Central PMCID: PMC9941592.
8. Naidoo K, Plummer L, McKean M, Mack A, Bowdle GK, Mullins MA, et al. Virtual faculty and peer mentoring to promote social belonging among minoritized physical therapist and nursing students. *Healthcare (Basel)*. 2022 Feb 23;10(3):416. doi:10.3390/healthcare10030416 PubMed PMID: 35326893; PubMed Central PMCID: PMC8948746.
9. Zebib L, Irani S, Salami SS, Kraft K, Palapattu G, Goh KM. Michigan urology academy—our role in diversifying the urology workforce. *Urology*. 2023 Nov 1;181:18–23. doi:10.1016/j.urology.2023.07.031

10. Atwal A, McKay E, Sriram V. Understanding the difference, makes the difference: perceptions of Black and Minoritised ethnic occupational therapists on mentoring. *BMC Health Services Research*. 2023 Oct 2;23(1):1050. doi:10.1186/s12913-023-10012-w