

Recommendation 1.1 Evidence Profile (Qualitative)

Recommendation question 1b: What are the values, preferences, barriers and facilitators associated with delivering education to address anti-Black racism in nursing?

Population: Nurses and nursing students

Phenomenon: Values placed on the outcomes of receiving education to address anti-Black racism in nursing, preferences for how education is delivered, barriers and facilitators to the uptake and sustainability of delivering education

Context: When delivering or receiving education related to addressing anti-Black racism in nursing

Settings: Health-care organizations and academic institutions

Notes: Due to a paucity of literature available to directly answer this research question, a search for indirect evidence was conducted. The population was broadened to search for education provided to all health providers and health profession students and the intervention was broadened to include education focused on addressing racism, rather than anti-Black racism specifically. The indirectness of this evidence (when compared to the original PPC question) was taken into consideration when grading the evidence.

Only review findings focused on people’s values and preferences for education were assessed using GRADE CERQual and used to inform this recommendation. Information about barriers and facilitators was narratively summarized and can be found under the ‘Implementation strategies’ section for this recommendation in the guideline.

Recommendation 1.1: The expert panel suggests that health and social service organizations and academic institutions provide education programs led by experienced facilitators who foster authentic dialogue grounded in safety when addressing topics on anti-Black racism in nursing. Education programs may include:

- small and large group discussions
- critical self-reflection and self-sharing activities
- activities that challenge personal bias

Review finding 1: Many participants preferred education that integrated small and large group discussion. Groups helped learners to actively reflect on, discuss and practice the concepts learned. Individuals expressed greater willingness to share their perspectives on sensitive topics in smaller groups.

Studies contributing to the Finding	CERQual Assessment				Overall CERQual Assessment of Confidence	Explanation of Judgement
	Assessment of Methodological Limitations	Assessment of Relevance	Assessment of Coherence	Assessment of Adequacy of Data		
(1–5)	Minor concerns Of the five studies, two had low risk of bias and three had some concerns due to no mention of reflexivity, no justification of research design or lack of detail	Moderate concerns Participants were non-nurses (ie. counselling, pharmacy and medical students and physicians); however, differences in the	No concerns	Moderate concerns Only five studies with relatively thin data supported this finding. However, this is a relatively simple and descriptive finding, so we had only	Moderate confidence ⊕⊕⊕○	This finding was graded as moderate confidence due to minor concerns related to methodological limitations and moderate concerns related to relevance and adequacy of the data. There were no concerns related to coherence.

	regarding data analysis.	population are not likely to change the findings. It is more concerning that none of the studies specifically focused on addressing anti-Black racism.		moderate concerns about adequacy of the data. ¹		
--	--------------------------	--	--	--	--	--

Review finding 1: Individual Study Details

Reference	Study Design	Country	Participant details	Description of education	Illustrative quotes
(4)	Mixed methods evaluation using surveys	USA	Medical school faculty	Narrative medicine anti-racism program designed to increase participants' comfort engaging in concepts of race and anti-racism, confidence teaching and incorporating topics of race and social justice into medical school curricula, and view of their own knowledge in terms of racial justice work. Each workshop consisted of a lecture and a small-group breakout session incorporating group discussion of short creative text reading, and reflective writing.	"The ability to reflect in a small-group setting with safety using narrative probes as a mechanism to promote this reflection and dialogue [was different than other DEI workshops]"
(5)	Mixed methods evaluation study using open-ended survey questions	USA	University medical centre staff	Participants received unconscious bias training. The training emphasized bias as an unconscious process and included activities to help people become more aware of these mental shortcuts. It provided strategies to help address unconscious bias.	"Participants consistently commended the use of small and large group discussion during the trainings and the "interaction of everyone at the table and willingness to share""

(2)	Mixed methods using pre/post evaluation surveys	Ireland	Medical students	A student-led antiracism reading education program in an Irish medical school. Participants were assigned readings and videos exploring racial injustice in medicine and attended a 90 min. virtual small-group discussion.	“Students identified that both the reading resources and the discussion groups were important and informative elements of the programme (n = 24). One student wrote: “. . . hearing other people talk about what they took away from the readings - their perspective in understanding the readings was valuable to me”
(1)	Consensual qualitative research (analysis of journal entries)	USA	Graduate counseling and psychology students	This training sought to share knowledge about racial microaggressions in counseling, promote self- and other awareness of racial microaggressions, and help counselors develop skills to respond to racial microaggressions in a clinical context.	<p>“Many trainees (64%) specified that discussion during the lecture was helpful (trainees of color = 0.55%; White trainees = 65%). One trainee of color commented, “The actual discussion after the presentation was much more useful because it had people be able to speak towards their experiences.””</p> <p>“A third category highlighted small group discussion as helpful during the training. Three distinct categories emerged within small group as most helpful: discussion, practice, and environment.”</p> <p>“Most trainees (76%; trainees of color = 76%; White trainees = 77%) commented that the lecture was helpful, citing discussion of the case scenarios as a powerful learning experience. For instance, one trainee of color reported, “The most helpful part of the training was the case scenarios ... Translating knowledge into action was the most helpful part of the microaggression training.”</p>
(3)	Qualitative descriptive design (using written weekly reflections)	USA	Pharmacy students	The elective course focused on exposing students to the root causes of health disparities, contemporary factors that perpetuate disparities, and evidence-based policies to reduce health disparities. The course emphasized critical thinking, robust discussions, and learning challenging constructs through self-discovery.	“Even with the elective being so tiny, having the discussion in the circles where we listened to each other speak about things so personal made me learn so much about so many members of our class that I would not have ever guessed before. It was a really good experience and I am grateful that I have the language to articulate the different intersections that we view social justice issues from.”

Review finding 2: Across many studies, participants were interested in activities that involved various dimensions of self-reflection. Preferred activities included self-reflective dialogue and reflecting on past experiences of unconscious bias. Participants enjoyed engaging in immersive role play and cultural connections activities to facilitate empathy through self-reflection.						
Studies contributing to the Finding	CERQual Assessment				Overall CERQual Assessment of Confidence	Explanation of Judgement
	Assessment of Methodological Limitations	Assessment of Relevance	Assessment of Coherence	Assessment of Adequacy of Data		
(3,7–9)	<p>Minor concerns</p> <p>Of the four studies, two had no concerns and two had some concerns primarily due to no mention of reflexivity.</p>	<p>Minor concerns</p> <p>Participants are nurses and midwives in one study, and counselors in training, medical students and pharmacy students in the other studies. Differences in the population are not likely to change the findings but it is concerning that no studies specifically focused on addressing anti-Black racism.</p>	<p>No concerns</p>	<p>Moderate concerns</p> <p>Only four studies with relatively thin data supported this finding. However, this is a relatively simple and descriptive finding, so we only have moderate concerns about adequacy of the data. ¹</p>	<p>Moderate confidence</p> <p>⊕⊕⊕○</p>	<p>The finding was graded as moderate confidence due to minor concerns related to methodological limitations and relevance and moderate concerns about adequacy of the data. There were no concerns related to coherence.</p>

Review finding 2: Individual Study Details

Reference	Study Design	Country	Participant details	Description of Education	Illustrative quotes
(8)	Qualitative content analysis (using data collected from journal entries)	USA	Master's level counselling in training students	For this project, students are asked to choose a character from a different background than their own whom they carried throughout their experiences during a long semester. Students kept bi-weekly journals documenting how their character would	“As I was imagining how my character would react to situations in my life, I would ask myself questions like “How would this population react to this? How would they feel? Do I agree with this? Do I think they would agree with this?” By mentally asking myself these questions, I would think before I made a quick judgment or formed an opinion. I plan to continue asking myself questions like these before forming judgments or opinions

				experience their daily happenings.	because I believe it will make me a more empathetic, open person”. “As I was completing this cultural connection assignment, I was able to critically think through things that I hear every day in my life as a white female living in a small town..... This assignment allowed me to take a step outside of myself and examine these same responses from an African American male’s perspective and I was more aware of the fact that when they say, “Black lives matter”, this isn’t an attack on all other races ...”
(9)	Mixed methods evaluation study using open-ended survey questions	UK	Senior nursing and midwifery practitioners	Four-hour unconscious racial bias training workshop with activities focused on activating stereotypes, exploring differences between unconscious and implicit bias, discussing the development of bias, and reflecting on student experiences of prejudice, harassment and discrimination.	Theme-Reflection of unconscious bias- Facilitated reflection of own lack of knowledge of the subject and individuals’ experience. Theme-Reflection of unconscious bias- Considering our personal unconscious bias and the impact on our professional lives.
(7)	Interpretive thematic analysis (of focus groups)	USA	Medical students	A skills-based elective to recognize and manage implicit bias in the learning environment. It incorporated active learning exercises (reflection and perspective-taking exercises, as well as realistic and relevant role-plays)	“The writing assignment that asked us to remember one moment where we noticed implicit bias in ourselves was really helpful. It made me reflect on something that I hadn’t thought about in a while. I didn’t realize that I could make progress thinking about it the way that I did.” “The idea of perspective taking and imagining self versus the others. I think the idea was like recognizing that the other person’s reaction or perception is influenced by their past experience, and that you need to recognize that, but not necessarily put yourself in their shoes.”
(3)	Qualitative descriptive design (using written weekly reflections)	USA	Pharmacy students	The elective course focused on exposing students to the root causes of health disparities, contemporary factors that	“While I am so very interested in having open and honest discussions about the issues that face our society with people who may disagree with me, I find that I am often at a lack of words, especially

				perpetuate disparities, and evidence-based policies to reduce health disparities. The course emphasized critical thinking, robust discussions, and learning challenging constructs through self-discovery.	when I see that my opinion on the matter should rightfully (that any sound being with a heart) is the obvious issue... I appreciate the activities you present us with; they challenge my thought not only about racial and ethnic issues in our society (even related to health) but also my thought of myself (encouraging introspection)."
--	--	--	--	--	---

Review finding 3: Many participants valued engaging in educational activities that challenged their personal biases and brought about genuine feelings of empathy for those who have been exposed to racism or discrimination.

Studies contributing to the Finding	CERQual Assessment				Overall CERQual Assessment of Confidence	Explanation of Judgement
	Assessment of Methodological Limitations	Assessment of Relevance	Assessment of Coherence	Assessment of Adequacy of Data		
(3,8,10)	Minor concerns One study had low risk of bias and two studies had some concerns primarily due to no mention of reflexivity. In one study, the statement of findings could have been more explicit and clearly described.	Moderate concerns Although the participants are non-nurses (ie. counsellors, pharmacy and medical students/physicians), differences in the population are not likely to change the findings. It is more concerning that none of the studies specifically focused on addressing anti-Black racism.	No concerns	Moderate concerns Only three studies with relatively thin data support this finding. However, this is a relatively descriptive finding, so we only have moderate concerns about adequacy of the data. ¹	⊕⊕⊕○ Moderate confidence	The finding was graded as moderate confidence due to minor concerns about methodological limitations and moderate concerns related to relevance and adequacy of the data. There were no concerns related to coherence.

Review finding 3: Individual Study Details

Reference	Study Design	Country	Participant details	Description of education	Illustrative quotes
(8)	Qualitative content analysis (using data collected from journal entries)	USA	Master's level counselling in training students	For this project, students are asked to choose a character from a different background than their own whom they carry throughout their experiences during a long semester. Students kept bi-weekly journals documenting how their character would experience their daily happenings.	<p>'One student stated, "the fact that I have never had to worry about some of the things they had to worry about was really eye-opening". Another student reported a similar awareness in the following way: "Something as simple as going to the grocery store is never something I have to think about as a white man. I have never had to experience suspicious eyes in a local store. Unfortunately, this is not the case for people of color'</p> <p>"It was very interesting to put myself in her shoes, to think of what the people looking at me in the store might think if I was a black woman or an immigrant, it was very grounding. Like, I take for granted just grabbing something small at the store and not getting a cart, reaching into my purse to grab my phone, wearing baggy clothes, and I had to stop and think, "If I were her and doing this would they think I'm stealing?" or "Would they assume I'm stealing?" It was definitely a very grounding and eye-opening experience"</p> <p>"When I had to put myself in their shoes, I had to do research. This forced me to watch videos/read more about the other culture, allowing me to gain more of an understanding of their history and background. Without doing this assignment, I would have probably not have looked up the information"</p> <p>"I imagined myself being judged everywhere I go just because I might look different than the people around me. It's not fair that minority groups have to live this way every day and I can only imagine how it would take a toll on one's mental health over time"</p>
(3)	Qualitative descriptive design (using written weekly reflections)	USA	Pharmacy students	The elective course focused on exposing students to the root causes of health disparities, contemporary factors that perpetuate disparities, and evidence-based policies to reduce health disparities. The course emphasized critical thinking, robust discussions, and learning	<p>"It truly is a sad moment as I write my last reflection in a class that I don't want to end. This class changed my life in many ways. I learned about my own biases and learned how to articulate what social determinants of health and equity are. I learned how to view my own intersectionality as well as that of others. I can't even articulate how much I learned in this reflection because it was really that much."</p>

				challenging constructs through self-discovery.	
(10)	Mixed methods evaluation survey using open-ended questions	UK	Medical students, physician associate trainees, and qualified doctors.	Bystander Intervention Training (BiT), a simulation based small-group training program, was designed to teach medical students and physicians how to tackle discrimination. Participants worked with an actor to practice behavioural interventions. An important focus is placed within this training on using one's own privilege to act as an ally	'It was also interesting and a bit shocking to hear about some of my colleagues' experiences, but this had highlighted to me how important it is for me to intervene'

References

1. Dunn M, Chambers C, Cho J, Cheng M. Future counselors' voices: A qualitative investigation of microaggression training. *J Multicult Couns & Deve*. 2022 Oct;50(4):238–55.
2. Lynn TM, D'urzo KA, Vaughan-Ogunlusi O, Wiesendanger K, Colbert-Kaip S, Capcara A, et al. The impact of a student-led anti-racism programme on medical students' perceptions and awareness of racial bias in medicine and confidence to advocate against racism. *Medical Education Online*. 2023 Dec 31;28(1):2176802.
3. Avant ND, Gillespie GL. Pushing for health equity through structural competency and implicit bias education: A qualitative evaluation of a racial/ethnic health disparities elective course for pharmacy learners. *Currents in Pharmacy Teaching and Learning*. 2019 Apr;11(4):382–93.
4. Holdren S, Iwai Y, Lenze NR, Weil AB, Randolph AM. A novel narrative medicine approach to DEI training for medical school faculty. *Teaching and Learning in Medicine*. 2023 Aug 8;35(4):457–66.
5. Maria Alonso Luaces, Galliard J, Natabhona M. Mabachi, Rosalee Zackula. Lessons learned from implementing unconscious bias training at an academic medical center. *kjm*. 2022 Sep 21;15(3):336–46.
6. Glenton C, Carlsen B, Lewin S, Munthe-Kaas H, Colvin CJ, Tunçalp Ö, et al. Applying GRADE-CERQual to qualitative evidence synthesis findings—paper 5: how to assess adequacy of data. *Implementation Sci*. 2018 Jan;13(S1):14.
7. Gonzalez CM, Walker SA, Rodriguez N, Karp E, Marantz PR. It can be done! A skills-based elective in implicit bias recognition and management for preclinical medical students. *Academic Medicine*. 2020 Dec;95(12S):S150–5.
8. Karayigit C, Ozier M. Using character connection journaling to develop cultural empathy. *British Journal of Guidance & Counselling*. 2023 Sep 3;51(5):727–38.
9. Pennington CR, Bliss E, Airey A, Bancroft M, Pryce-Miller M. A mixed-methods evaluation of unconscious racial bias training for NHS senior practitioners to improve the experiences of racially minoritised students. *BMJ Open*. 2023 Jan;13(1):e068819.
10. Tyson L, Skinner J, Hariharan B, Josiah B, Okongwu K, Semlyen J. Tackling discrimination in medicine head on: The impact of bystander intervention training. *Medical Teacher*. 2025 Jan 2;47(1):73–82.

Footnotes

¹ According to GRADE CERQual, for review findings that are simple and primarily descriptive, relatively superficial data may be sufficient. But when a review finding is complex or explanatory, e.g. when it suggests associations between different factors, you are less likely to have confidence in that finding if it is based on data that is too superficial to allow a sufficient exploration of the phenomenon (6).